

## ON SCHWARZ DIFFERENTIABILITY, III

BY

S. N. MUKHOPADHYAY (BURDWAN, WEST BENGAL)

Let  $f(x)$  be a real function defined on a closed interval  $[a, b]$  with the understanding that  $f(x) = f(a)$  if  $x < a$  and  $f(x) = f(b)$  if  $x > b$ . For  $x \in [a, b]$ , if the limit

$$\lim_{h \rightarrow 0} \frac{f(x+h) - f(x-h)}{2h}$$

exists, then it is called the *Schwarz derivative* ([6], p. 36) or the *symmetric derivative* [2] of  $f(x)$  at the point  $x$  and is denoted by  $f^{(1)}(x)$ . If the ordinary derivative  $f'(x)$  exists, then  $f^{(1)}(x)$  also exists and  $f^{(1)}(x) = f'(x)$ . The converse, however, is not true.

In [5], we have shown that if  $f(x)$  is continuous and Schwarz differentiable at each point  $x$  in  $[a, b]$ , then the set of points where  $f(x)$  is not differentiable is of the first category. Some other results on Schwarz differentiability can also be found in [1]-[4], [7] and [8].

In the present paper we construct an example of a function which is continuous and Schwarz differentiable everywhere in an interval  $(a, b)$  but not differentiable on an everywhere dense set of points there. According to the results already cited (Mukhopadhyay [5]), this everywhere dense set, however, must be a set of the first category.

No generality will be lost if we assume the interval of definition to be  $[0, 1]$ .

For each positive integer  $n$ , let  $D_n$  denote the set consisting of the points

$$0, \frac{1}{2^n}, \frac{2}{2^n}, \frac{3}{2^n}, \dots, \frac{2^n - 1}{2^n}, 1.$$

Let

$$u_n(x) = \begin{cases} 2^n \left( x - \frac{2k}{2^n} \right), & \text{if } \frac{2k}{2^n} \leq x \leq \frac{2k+1}{2^n}, \\ -2^n \left( x - \frac{2(k+1)}{2^n} \right), & \text{if } \frac{2k+1}{2^n} \leq x \leq \frac{2(k+1)}{2^n} \end{cases}$$

for  $k = 0, 1, 2, \dots, 2^{n-1} - 1$  and  $n = 1, 2, 3, \dots$ . Then

$$u'_n(x) = \begin{cases} 2^n, & \text{if } \frac{2k}{2^n} < x < \frac{2k+1}{2^n}, \\ -2^n, & \text{if } \frac{2k+1}{2^n} < x < \frac{2(k+1)}{2^n}, \end{cases}$$

and  $u_n(x)$  is not differentiable at the points of  $D_n$ .

Let

$$f(x) = \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{3^i} u_i(x).$$

Then  $f(x)$  will satisfy our requirements in  $(0, 1)$ . In fact:

I.  $f(x)$  is continuous in  $(0, 1)$ .

Since each  $u_i(x)$  is continuous and the series  $\sum 3^{-i} u_i(x)$  converges uniformly in  $(0, 1)$ , because  $|u_i(x)| \leq 1$  for  $x \in (0, 1)$  and  $i = 1, 2, \dots$ , the result follows immediately.

II.  $f(x)$  is not differentiable at the points of  $(\bigcup_1^{\infty} D_n) \cap (0, 1)$ .

Let  $c$  be any point of  $(\bigcup_1^{\infty} D_n) \cap (0, 1)$ . Then there exists the least positive integer  $r$  such that  $c$  is a point of  $D_r$  but not of  $D_{r-1}$ . It, therefore, follows that  $c$  is a point of non-differentiability of the functions  $u_i(x)$  for  $i \geq r$ , but each of the functions  $u_1(x), u_2(x), \dots, u_{r-1}(x)$  is differentiable at  $c$ .

Now

$$f(x) = \sum_{i=1}^{r-1} \frac{1}{3^i} u_i(x) + \sum_{i=r}^{\infty} \frac{1}{3^i} u_i(x) = f_1(x) + f_2(x),$$

say. So,  $f_1(x)$  is differentiable at  $x = c$ . We shall show that  $f_2(x)$  is not differentiable at  $x = c$ . We have

$$\begin{aligned} f_2(x) - f_2(c) &= \sum_{i=r}^{\infty} \frac{1}{3^i} u_i(x) - \sum_{i=r}^{\infty} \frac{1}{3^i} u_i(c) \\ &= \frac{1}{3^r} \{u_r(x) - u_r(c)\} + \sum_{i=r+1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{3^i} u_i(x), \end{aligned}$$

because  $u_i(c) = 0$  for  $i > r$ . So,

$$(1) \quad \frac{f_2(x) - f_2(c)}{x - c} = \frac{1}{3^r} \frac{u_r(x) - u_r(c)}{x - c} + \sum_{i=r+1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{3^i} \frac{u_i(x)}{x - c}.$$

It is now easy to see that the series

$$\sum_{i=r+1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{3^i} \frac{u_i(x)}{x-c}$$

converges uniformly in  $0 < |x-c| < \delta$  for some  $\delta > 0$ . For, if  $0 < x-c \leq 1/2^i$ , then  $u_i(x)/(x-c) = 2^i$  (this equality is a consequence of the similarity of two triangles) and if  $x-c > 1/2^i$ , there is a point  $x'$  such that  $0 < x'-c \leq 1/2^i$ , where  $u_i(x) = u_i(x')$ . So  $u_i(x)/(x-c) < u_i(x')/(x'-c) = 2^i$ . Hence for  $x > c$ ,  $u_i(x)/(x-c) \leq 2^i$ . Similarly,  $u_i(x)/(x-c) \geq -2^i$  for  $x < c$ . This shows that if  $\delta$  is a suitable fixed positive number, then the series

$$\sum_{i=r+1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{3^i} \frac{u_i(x)}{x-c}$$

converges uniformly in  $0 < |x-c| < \delta$ .

Taking right-hand and left-hand limits in (1), we get

$$\lim_{x \rightarrow c^+} \frac{f_2(x) - f_2(c)}{x-c} = -\frac{2^r}{3^r} + \sum_{r+1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{3^i} \cdot 2^i = \frac{2^r}{3^r}$$

and

$$\lim_{x \rightarrow c^-} \frac{f_2(x) - f_2(c)}{x-c} = \frac{2^r}{3^r} + \sum_{r+1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{3^i} \cdot (-2^i) = -\frac{2^r}{3^r}.$$

So,  $f_2(x)$  and, consequently,  $f(x)$  is not differentiable at  $x = c$ . Since  $c$  is any point of  $(\bigcup_1^{\infty} D_n) \cap (0, 1)$ , this proves the assertion.

III.  $f(x)$  is differentiable at every point of  $(0, 1)$  not belonging to  $\bigcup_1^{\infty} D_n$ .

Let  $\xi$  be any point of  $(0, 1)$  which does not belong to  $\bigcup_1^{\infty} D_n$ . Let

$$g_i(h) = \frac{u_i(\xi+h) - u_i(\xi)}{3^i \cdot h}, \quad \xi+h \in (0, 1).$$

Then  $|g_i(h)| \leq 2^i/3^i$  for every  $h \neq 0$ . Hence the series  $\sum_{i=1}^{\infty} g_i(h)$  is uniformly convergent in  $0 < |h| < \delta'$  for some  $\delta' > 0$ . Thus,

$$\begin{aligned} \lim_{h \rightarrow 0} \frac{f(\xi+h) - f(\xi)}{h} &= \lim_{h \rightarrow 0} \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \frac{u_i(\xi+h) - u_i(\xi)}{3^i \cdot h} \\ &= \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \lim_{h \rightarrow 0} \frac{u_i(\xi+h) - u_i(\xi)}{3^i \cdot h} = \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \left(\frac{2}{3}\right)^i \eta_i, \end{aligned}$$

where  $\eta_i = 1$  or  $-1$  according as  $2k/2^i < \xi < (2k+1)/2^i$  or  $(2k+1)/2^i < \xi < 2(k+1)/2^i$  for some  $k$ , where  $k = 0, 1, 2, \dots, 2^{i-1} - 1$ . This shows that  $f(x)$  is differentiable at  $\xi$ .

IV.  $f(x)$  is Schwarz differentiable at the points of  $(\bigcup_1^\infty D_n) \cap (0, 1)$ .

Let  $\xi$  be any point of  $(\bigcup_1^\infty D_n) \cap (0, 1)$ . There exists then the least positive integer  $r$  such that  $\xi \in D_r$ , but  $\xi \notin D_{r-1}$ . Then

$$\sum_{i=r}^{\infty} \frac{u_i(\xi+h) - u_i(\xi-h)}{3^i \cdot 2h} = 0$$

for  $0 < |h| < \delta''$ , say. It follows that if

$$f_2(x) = \sum_{i=r}^{\infty} \frac{1}{3^i} u_i(x),$$

then  $f_2^{(1)}(\xi) = 0$ . The functions  $u_1(x), u_2(x), \dots, u_{r-1}(x)$  are differentiable and, consequently, Schwarz differentiable at  $\xi$ . Therefore

$$f_1(x) = \sum_{i=1}^{r-1} \frac{1}{3^i} u_i(x)$$

and  $f(x) = f_1(x) + f_2(x)$  is Schwarz differentiable at  $\xi$ , too.

Since  $\bigcup_1^\infty D_n$  is everywhere dense in  $(0, 1)$ , the construction of the function  $f(x)$  is complete.

I am thankful to Dr. B. K. Lahiri for his kind help and suggestions in the preparation of this paper.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] Z. Charzyński, *Sur les fonctions dont la dérivée symétrique est partout finie*, Fundamenta Mathematicae 21 (1933), p. 214-225.
- [2] A. Khintchine, *Recherches sur la structure des fonctions mesurables*, ibidem 9 (1927), p. 212-279.
- [3] S. Mazurkiewicz, *Sur la dérivée première généralisée*, ibidem 11 (1928), p. 145-147.
- [4] S. N. Mukhopadhyay, *On Schwarz differentiability, I*, Forthcoming in Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, India, 36 (1966), Section A.
- [5] — *On Schwarz differentiability, II*, Revue Roumaine des Mathématiques Pures et Appliquées 9 (1964), p. 859-862.

[6] I. P. Natanson, *Theory of functions of a real variable*, vol. II, New York 1960.

[7] W. Sierpiński, *Sur une hypothèse de M. Mazurkiewicz*, *Fundamenta Mathematicae* 11 (1928), p. 148-150.

[8] E. Szpilrajn, *Remarque sur la dérivée symétrique*, *ibidem* 21 (1933), p. 226-235.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS  
UNIVERSITY OF BURDWAN

*Reçu par la Rédaction le 7. 3. 1966*